

1 Nada Smith

2 signed?

3 A. No.

4 Q. You had also stated that after the
5 file was completed, you would take it and
6 actually put it into a cabinet?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. I think we established that that
9 cabinet was not locked; correct?

10 A.  Correct.

11 Q. Would you look in the file jacket
12 to see that the papers -- all the papers --
13 were in order, or would you just take the file
14 and put it into the cabinet?

15 A. I would just take the file.

16 Sometimes I would check for the paperwork that
17 I filled out, the DMV paperwork, and I would
18 just pull out the whole file to get the papers
19 that I needed.

20 Q. Did you have a computer at your
21 desk?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Were you able to access the same
24 programs that the financing department had on
25 their computers?

1 Nada Smith

2 A. I don't believe so. I never even
3 tried, because I wasn't doing anything. But I
4 don't think I could.

5 Q. Would your computer get a
6 notification when financing was approved for a
7 particular client?

8 A. No.

9 Q. Do you know which computers would
10 have that?

11 A. Julio's.

12 Q. Did your father have access to the
13 same programs that Julio had on any of his
14 computers?

15 A. No, I don't think so.

16 Q. You said that Mr. Tuhin was
17 excited about getting his car?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Do you remember when you saw that
20 excitement? Was that the day he purchased the
21 car; correct?

22 A. Yes, the day he purchased the
23 vehicle.

24 Q. Did he have any complaints about
25 any documents that he had signed at that time?

1 Nada Smith

2 A. No.

3 Q. Did he ever say to you, "I don't
4 even know who I'm getting financing from"?

5 A. No.

6 Q. Did Mr. Chowdhury ever say that to
7 you?

8 A. No.

9 Q. What about Mr. Gabrys?

10 A. No.

11 Q. Do you remember any of those three
12 people ever saying to you at any time that, "I
13 didn't know I was getting financing from M&T
14 Bank"?

15 A. No.

16 Q. You had mentioned that there was
17 one person who made a complaint about forgery?

18 A. Yes, that Chinese client.

19 Q. Dong?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Do you know who they financed
22 with?

23 A. I don't know what their story
24 completely was, but I know that it had came up
25 as a complaint. I don't know who their bank

1 Nada Smith

2 was. I don't know what happened with that
3 client exactly.

4 Q. Do you know if that matter got
5 resolved?

6 A. I have no idea.

7 Q. I'm sorry if I asked this question
8 already. Let me just make sure.

9 A. Okay.

10 Q. Did you ever advertise during the
11 time that you worked there, other than on the
12 internet?

13 MR. SIMON: "You," referring to
14 the dealership?

15 MR. GROSSMAN: The dealership.

16 Q. Meaning the dealership; did you
17 ever advertise in newspapers?

18 A. I don't think so. I wouldn't
19 know.

20 Q. To the best of your knowledge you
21 advertised only on the internet? "You,"
22 meaning the dealership.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Again, I'm sorry if I already
25 asked this question. Do you remember any

1 Nada Smith
2 specific complaints made to you about the
3 internet price being lower than the price they
4 were told the car would sell for?

5 A. NO.

6 Q. Do you have any idea of the
7 approval process of any of the banks on how
8 they approved clients for financing?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Did Mr. Estrada ever have any
11 conversation with you and tell you the
12 difference of how one bank would approve
13 someone as opposed to another bank?

14 A. No.

15 Q. To the best of your knowledge,
16 before Mr. Estrada started working there did
17 you ever receive any complaints from any
18 customers that they were told that they can
19 lower their interest rate on their financing?

20 A. I don't think so. I don't
21 remember, but I don't think so.

22 Q. Let me ask you this. The first
23 time you remember hearing about customers
24 complaining about being told that they can
25 lower their interest rate was when Mr. Estrada

1 Nada Smith

2 was working for New York Motor Group?

3 A. Correct.

4 Q. You left there right before

5 Mr. Estrada left?

6 A. Right after he left. Right after
7 Mr. Estrada left, I left.

8 Q. Were you ever made aware by anyone
9 of any other complaints made against New York
10 Motor Group after Mr. Estrada left; that they
11 were being told that they can lower their
12 interest rate on their financing and that they
13 found out that they couldn't?

14 A. I don't know. I was there for a
15 short period of time after Mr. Estrada left.

16 Q. Mr. Keshavarz asked you about
17 cameras at New York Motor Group.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Were you involved in any way in
20 keeping or maintaining any of the film or video
21 from those cameras?

22 A. No.

23 Q. One of the questions that was
24 asked of you was whether or not you provided
25 full, 100 percent refunds on people who would

1 Nada Smith

2 request refunds on cars that they didn't want
3 to purchase?

4 A. Mm-hmm.

5 Q. I must have missed the answer.

6 Do you remember ever giving less
7 than 100 percent of a refund to someone who
8 wanted to bring back a car?

9 A. No. We always gave them back
10 100 percent, to my best knowledge.

11 Q. Do you know to what extent, if
12 any, M&T Bank would speak to any of the
13 customers or clients of New York Motor Group
14 prior to them applying for financing?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Do you know to what extent, if
17 any, M&T Bank would speak to the customers
18 during the financing process?

19 A. No.

20 Q. Do you know if M&T Bank would
21 even speak to the customers during the
22 financing process?

23 A. I don't know.

24 Q. Did Mr. Estrada ever come to you
25 and say that he was going to use another bank

1 Nada Smith

2 other than M&T Bank, because he didn't like
3 working with M&T Bank?

4 A. No.

5 Q. Did he ever come to you and say
6 that he was going work with another bank other
7 than Santander Bank, because he didn't like
8 working with Santander Bank?

9 A. No, he never talked to me about
10 any of that stuff.

11 MR. GROSSMAN: One minute and I'll
12 wind up. I have nothing further. Thank
13 you very much.

14 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

15 MR. LANE: I have no further
16 questions for Ms. Smith.

17 MR. SIMON: I have some questions.

18 I'm going to withhold them for us.

19 (Time noted: 5:52 p.m.)
20
21
22
23
24
25

1

2 A C K N O W L E D G M E N T

3

4 STATE OF NEW YORK)

5 : Ss

6 COUNTY OF)

7

8 I, NADA SMITH, hereby certify that I
9 have read the transcript of my testimony taken
10 under oath in my deposition of February 26,
11 2015; that the transcript is a true, complete
12 and correct record of my testimony, and that
13 the answers on the record as given by me are
14 true and correct.

15

16 _____ NADA SMITH

17

18

19 Signed and Subscribed to
20 before me, this _____ day
21 of _____, 2015

22

23 _____ Notary Public, State of New York

24

25

1

2 I N D E X

3

WITNESS
NADA SMITH

PAGE

4

Examination by:

5

MR. LANE
MR. KESHAVARZ
MS. LINDERMAYER
MR. GROSSMAN

6, 209

6

115

7

000

8

9 EXHIBITS

10

PLAINTIFF'S

DESCRIPTION

PAGE

11

1 Copy of Nada Smith's New York
State identification card

13

12

2 Copy of Nada Smith's United
States Uniformed Services ID card

14

13

3 Two-page document entitled "NYC
Department of Consumer Affairs
Notice of Hearing"

84

14

4 Two-page document entitled "NYC
Department of Consumer Affairs
Notice of Hearing"

86

15

5 One-page document entitled
"Technology Insurance
Company, Inc., Theft Deterrent
Product Protection Certificate"

104

16

6 One-page document entitled
"Santander Consumer USA
Guarantee of Title"

105

22

7 One-page document entitled
"New York State Department of
Motor Vehicles, Odometer and
Damage Disclosure Statement"

108

23

24 INDEX CONTINUES...

25

1

EXHIBITS

3	PLAINTIFF'S	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
4	8	Document entitled "Santander Consumer USA Reference Release Form"	207
5	9	One-page document depicting one money order	224
6	10	One-page document depicting two money orders	225
7	11	One-page document depicting two money orders	225
8	12	One-page document entitled "Retail Certificate of Sale"	235
9	13	One-page document entitled "Retail Certificate of Sale"	235
0	14	One-page document entitled "Retail Certificate of Sale"	235

15 ooo

16

17 DOCUMENTS AND/OR INFORMATION REQUESTED
DESCRIPTION

PAGE

18 Insert name of Long Island City dealership
19 that Ms. Smith began working at in January
of 2014

21

20 Provide copies of Ms. Smith's tax returns from 2010 to the present

43

Provide information related to where
22 Ms. Smith banked and how much money she
was paid by her father during the time
23 she worked at the New York Motor Group

93

24

INDEX CONTINUES . . .

25

1

2 DOCUMENTS AND/OR INFORMATION REQUESTED PAGE
3 DESCRIPTION

4 Provide information about money paid by
5 Mr. Eltouby or his wife to his daughter,
6 Nada Smith, during the time she worked
7 at New York Motor Group; provide information
8 related to which banks this money was
9 deposited into

95

10 ooo

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

C E R T I F I C A T E

3

4 STATE OF NEW YORK)
5 COUNTY OF NEW YORK } Ss:

6

7 I, MEDEA EDER, a Shorthand Reporter
8 and Notary Public within and for the State of
9 New York, do hereby certify:

10 That NADA SMITH, the witness whose
11 examination is hereinbefore set forth, was duly
12 sworn by me and that this transcript of such
13 examination is a true record of the testimony
14 given by such witness.

15 I further certify that I am not
16 related to any of the parties to this action by
17 blood or marriage and that I am in no way
18 interested in the outcome of this matter.

19 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
20 set my hand this 16th day of March 2015.

21

22

MEDEA EDER

23

24

25

\$	11747 [1] - 11:4 11754 [1] - 4:12 11:00 [2] - 101:8, 101:22 11:39 [1] - 61:5 12 [10] - 235:5, 235:8, 235:23, 236:8, 238:15, 238:16, 239:6, 240:7, 240:14, 286:10 12:19 [1] - 86:12 13 [10] - 235:5, 235:8, 237:20, 238:5, 238:25, 240:7, 240:10, 241:8, 285:11, 286:12 13-CV-02337 [1] - 1:4 13-CV-5643 [1] - 1:8 13-CV-7290 [1] - 1:18 13-CV-7291 [1] - 1:13 14 [5] - 235:5, 235:8, 241:12, 285:12, 286:13 14-CV-2980 [1] - 2:3 14-CV-2981 [1] - 2:7 16 [1] - 3:9 1610 [1] - 40:2 16th [2] - 4:17, 288:20 17A [1] - 10:21 192 [1] - 2:23 1:15 [1] - 99:16 1:18 [1] - 115:11	4 4 [9] - 1:19, 3:3, 3:18, 4:5, 86:3, 86:7, 87:7, 87:21, 285:15 43 [1] - 286:20 4700 [1] - 182:5 4th [2] - 2:17, 3:13	226:7 , 234:10, 286:6 93 [1] - 286:23 95 [1] - 287:6 9:00 [1] - 101:12
A			
		5	A-B-R-E-U [1] - 52:23 A-L-E-S-T-I-E [1] - 52:22 A.M [1] - 2:19 a.m [2] - 1:24, 61:5 ability [3] - 124:16, 124:22, 162:2 able [4] - 230:3, 230:18, 232:22, 276:23 Abreu [1] - 52:21 Absolutely [1] - 139:16 absolutely [3] - 8:23, 151:18, 255:17 accepting [1] - 98:4 access [4] - 54:20, 61:13, 276:23, 277:12 account [25] - 91:11, 91:14, 92:9, 92:14, 93:8, 117:23, 117:24, 118:21, 118:22, 122:19, 123:14, 123:20, 129:19, 132:9, 132:13, 133:4, 232:19, 232:22, 232:25, 233:2, 233:7, 233:24, 234:8, 258:6, 272:9 accountant [3] - 64:4, 64:6, 142:7 accounts [20] - 116:24, 117:18, 118:2, 118:4, 118:17, 121:11, 122:13, 122:16, 122:18, 124:10, 124:20, 125:6, 125:8, 125:14, 128:15, 128:18, 130:9, 228:5, 228:9, 234:6 accurately [1] - 246:17 accuse [1] - 149:6 acknowledgment [10] - 31:15, 53:3, 102:19, 120:16, 145:17, 172:24,
0			
1		6	
2		7	
		8	
		9	

179:8, 193:17, 218:20, 253:16	ahead [5] - 16:11, 76:16, 117:9, 187:24, 231:4	answer [38] - 7:11, 7:19, 7:24, 9:11, 13:9, 16:3, 16:5, 16:20, 20:19, 29:6, 29:21, 44:16, 55:7, 61:10, 73:15, 74:14, 74:16, 74:19, 74:22, 80:24, 97:25, 98:6, 100:5, 100:11, 100:14, 110:16, 118:10, 121:23, 122:7, 140:15, 193:4, 214:11, 214:13, 215:2, 215:6, 242:13, 282:5	271:24, 277:6, 280:8	August [1] - 75:16 authority [2] - 67:11, 124:8
action [1] - 288:16	Ahmad [2] - 115:16, 190:6	aps [2] - 252:2	areas [1] - 128:5	authorized [1] - 124:19
ACTION [6] - 1:5, 1:10, 1:15, 1:19, 2:4, 2:9	AHMAD [2] - 3:8, 3:10	area [2] - 71:13, 85:12	ARIANA [1] - 3:15	Auto [13] - 31:6, 31:14, 31:21, 32:5, 33:4, 33:6, 47:19, 47:21, 128:10, 131:14, 131:18, 245:11, 247:4
active [2] - 18:2, 18:8	al [6] - 1:6, 1:10, 1:15, 1:20, 2:5, 2:9	Ariana [1] - 235:20	armed [2] - 15:13, 15:18	auto [1] - 247:8
actual [2] - 70:25, 182:18	Alabama [1] - 19:5	Army [1] - 15:20	arrangements [1] - 275:17	automatic [2] - 122:12, 129:17
ad [1] - 65:4	Alestie [1] - 52:21	ARR)(SMG [6] - 1:4, 1:9, 1:13, 1:18, 2:3, 2:8	arrested [4] - 74:20, 75:3, 75:7, 130:21	automatically [1] - 122:16
Adam [1] - 15:17	Alex [2] - 49:10, 51:24	arrests [4] - 130:11, 130:16, 131:4, 131:6	automobile [9] - 244:5, 244:10, 251:13, 251:21, 254:11, 263:2, 263:4, 264:6, 264:11	
addition [1] - 7:8	ALKHATIB [2] - 1:3, 3:3	aside [2] - 130:15, 169:19	Avenue [6] - 2:23, 4:17, 6:5, 10:9, 37:5, 40:2	
additional [1] - 242:9	allegation [4] - 137:11, 139:11, 159:6, 159:18	assignment [1] - 166:11	aware [14] - 81:24, 89:14, 121:5, 138:17, 149:19, 209:22, 232:4, 234:9, 240:17, 247:5, 260:15, 270:20, 281:8	
address [11] - 6:5, 10:8, 10:13, 10:19, 19:16, 19:18, 21:15, 40:6, 113:11, 113:16, 190:10	allegations [5] - 92:25, 130:16, 259:24, 260:11, 260:15	assist [2] - 23:15, 53:5	B	
addressed [1] - 115:21	alleged [1] - 159:17	assistant [1] - 86:24		
adjusted [1] - 200:11	allegedly [1] - 151:11	Assistant [5] - 24:18, 24:19, 24:20, 24:21, 24:22		
ads [2] - 65:9, 65:12	allow [1] - 263:24	assisted [2] - 41:7, 41:8		
advertise [3] - 65:3, 279:10, 279:17	allowed [9] - 44:14, 76:14, 100:4, 135:3, 135:7, 135:10, 177:10, 184:3, 184:4	assisting [2] - 24:22, 24:25		
advertised [1] - 279:21	almost [3] - 93:4, 170:16, 171:3	associate [1] - 32:17		
advice [1] - 85:19	ALSO [1] - 4:22	assume [7] - 8:5, 8:6, 8:7, 155:13, 169:8, 177:25, 259:21		
advise [3] - 214:13, 242:11, 246:13	Amir [3] - 35:17, 36:2, 36:13	assumed [1] - 76:9		
advisement [1] - 44:5	Amityville [5] - 28:21, 29:3, 29:9, 30:2, 31:12	attempt [1] - 269:22		
Affairs [15] - 57:7, 57:12, 58:19, 75:21, 84:17, 85:7, 85:20, 86:5, 87:6, 88:19, 88:23, 89:5, 142:13, 285:14, 285:16	AMIR [1] - 35:19	attention [1] - 207:20		
afford [13] - 147:20, 147:25, 148:22, 148:23, 148:24, 148:25, 191:22, 191:25, 192:11, 196:15, 196:21, 256:6	amount [5] - 79:18, 81:22, 250:23, 264:5, 272:8	attorney [8] - 7:10, 11:24, 12:3, 20:19, 21:14, 22:16, 44:19, 242:4		
AFTERNOON [1] - 115:12	amounts [1] - 233:16	Attorney [2] - 3:18, 4:10		
afternoon [2] - 115:16, 242:3	AND [4] - 3:18, 5:5, 5:9, 5:13	attorneys [5] - 5:6, 115:17, 235:21, 251:15, 262:12		
Afterwards [1] - 222:4	AND/OR [2] - 286:17, 287:2	Attorneys [3] - 3:3, 4:5, 4:16		
age [1] - 40:23	Angel [26] - 49:16, 49:21, 49:23, 50:9, 50:10, 50:13, 50:16, 51:13, 53:5, 53:12, 53:16, 53:21, 56:2, 56:7, 66:7, 66:11, 66:15, 66:18, 89:15, 156:5, 173:21, 245:20, 247:9, 247:25, 248:2, 250:10	approval [8] - 127:2, 127:7, 178:11, 228:10, 232:15, 258:17, 274:6, 280:7		
ago [4] - 120:12, 170:16, 170:17, 171:4	Angel's [1] - 49:17	approve [1] - 280:12		
AGREED [3] - 5:5, 5:9, 5:13	angry [1] - 184:21	approved [8] - 50:4, 178:24, 179:3, 271:18, 271:22,		
Agreement [1] - 268:14	Answer [2] - 242:20, 246:16	200:5, 200:7, 200:10, 202:21, 203:2, 203:13, 204:9		
agreement [2] - 188:24, 275:14				
agreements [2] - 33:10, 154:8				

145:19, 166:4, 176:14, 178:23, 178:24, 179:11, 179:14, 214:3, 214:5, 214:6, 231:19, 234:19, 244:14, 244:15, 249:19, 250:18, 253:19, 253:20, 258:6, 267:22, 267:25, 268:6, 268:24, 269:7, 271:18, 272:9, 274:19, 274:22, 278:25, 280:12, 280:13, 282:25, 283:6	Bates [1] - 265:21 Bates-stamp [1] - 265:21 Bay [3] - 27:2, 27:4, 34:12 become [1] - 258:12 becoming [1] - 250:22 began [4] - 30:14, 58:23, 66:3, 286:18 begin [6] - 8:10, 22:10, 23:23, 50:18, 222:12, 227:25 beginning [7] - 20:11, 75:17, 115:19, 174:16, 175:3, 176:3, 245:15 behalf [8] - 56:25, 88:3, 115:3, 115:7, 118:16, 126:4, 129:22, 269:15 beings [1] - 121:13 belief [1] - 44:5 belonged [1] - 107:23 beneath [1] - 50:8 Bengali [1] - 133:25 Bengalis [1] - 76:20 beside [1] - 168:8 best [7] - 167:14, 242:12, 247:2, 255:18, 279:20, 280:15, 282:10 between [18] - 5:6, 28:7, 32:4, 75:16, 106:25, 129:18, 142:21, 159:18, 179:2, 188:18, 188:19, 195:10, 218:18, 218:23, 265:2, 265:6, 265:10, 273:11 Between [2] - 145:13 big [1] - 104:5 bill [17] - 25:14, 125:10, 144:5, 149:10, 150:11, 150:15, 169:14, 172:9, 174:21, 175:16, 175:17, 175:19, 179:23, 179:25, 180:9, 181:5, 269:2 Bill [3] - 170:13, 170:14, 174:23 bills [11] - 125:10, 126:2, 133:10, 171:15, 172:20, 172:23, 173:12, 175:25, 182:16, 258:15	209:8, 241:22 BRENER [2] - 4:18, 99:14 Brick [1] - 4:6 brief [4] - 61:6, 86:13, 207:18, 241:23 Brief [2] - 188:3, 209:15 bring [4] - 71:7, 248:4, 248:5, 282:8 brings [1] - 141:22 Broadway [3] - 2:17, 3:13, 3:20 broken [1] - 155:10 Brooklyn [1] - 3:9 brother [1] - 129:7 brought [4] - 18:24, 145:5, 192:7, 205:16 BRUCE [1] - 4:4 Building [1] - 3:19 bundle [1] - 84:9 business [5] - 37:21, 38:12, 101:10, 130:5, 245:14 buy [7] - 81:11, 91:16, 91:20, 125:20, 216:24, 230:20, 253:2 buyer's [7] - 57:22, 174:19, 174:21, 176:18, 179:17, 179:23, 180:15 buying [1] - 231:17 BY [12] - 3:6, 3:10, 3:15, 3:21, 4:8, 4:13, 4:18, 6:10, 115:15, 209:18, 235:19, 242:2	204:6, 204:17, 281:17, 281:21 capable [1] - 243:2 capacity [3] - 138:8, 203:15, 204:9 Capital [6] - 245:11, 245:21, 245:22, 247:4, 247:9, 252:18 Caption [1] - 1:22 car [54] - 37:9, 72:9, 92:22, 108:16, 114:10, 120:22, 133:13, 133:14, 133:15, 133:17, 133:20, 139:12, 140:22, 143:8, 144:19, 147:22, 164:4, 204:14, 206:7, 206:19, 206:23, 207:15, 207:17, 229:15, 229:25, 230:20, 231:17, 232:13, 232:16, 239:7, 239:11, 239:14, 241:7, 244:11, 244:13, 249:24, 250:5, 251:7, 253:2, 253:24, 254:16, 255:3, 263:11, 263:13, 263:16, 263:20, 264:8, 271:23, 271:25, 273:2, 277:17, 277:21, 280:4, 282:8 carbon [2] - 172:19, 182:18 card [18] - 12:20, 13:19, 13:22, 14:5, 14:16, 14:25, 15:7, 15:11, 69:16, 74:3, 74:6, 79:14, 95:16, 97:5, 97:6, 285:11, 285:12 cards [2] - 25:17, 91:9 care [9] - 23:7, 32:19, 45:19, 92:21, 102:11, 130:14, 255:5, 256:24, 256:25 CAROLYN [1] - 3:15 cars [14] - 63:3, 119:10, 119:13, 133:11, 137:16, 220:6, 245:8, 248:8, 248:17, 254:6, 255:16, 262:5, 264:18, 282:2
C			